



## International Journal of Instruction Article Evaluation Form

Mr. /Mrs.

It is to acknowledge you that the Executive Committee of *International Journal of Instruction* has decided that the article mentioned below would be reviewed by you. Thank you very much for your contributions.

**Asim ARI**  
**Editor in Chief**

**Name of the article:** Implementation of Learning Innovations to Improve Teacher Competence in Professional Certificate Programs for In-Service Teachers

After reviewing the attached article, please read each item carefully and select the response that best reflects your opinion. To register your response, please **mark** or **type in** the appropriate block.

	Yes	Partially	No
Do you think the title is appropriate?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Does the abstract summarize the article clearly and effectively?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Are the objectives set clearly?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Is the issue stated clearly?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the literature review adequate?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the design of the research appropriate, and the exemplary, if any, suitable?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the methodology consistent with the practice?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the findings expressed clearly?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the presentation of the findings adequate and consistent?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the tables, if any, arranged well?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the conclusions and generalizations based on the findings?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the suggestions meaningful, valid, and based on the findings?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the references adequate?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the language clear and understandable?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is cohesion achieved throughout the article?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the work contributing to the field?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

- Evaluation:**
- The article can be published as it is.
  - The article can be published after some revision.
  - The article must undergo a major revision before it can be resubmitted to the journal.
  - The article cannot be published.

Would you like to see the revised article if you have suggested any revisions?  Yes  No

**Please write your report either on this paper or on a spare paper.**

### REPORT

Section of the Manuscript	Comments and Notes
Title- Abstract- Summary	Writing keyword in the line with the variables mentioned in the title of the study Limited: Learning innovations, Teacher competence, professional certificate program
Introduction and Literature Review	The problem of the study, Questions, Importance, Limitations did not appear Diversify the references in the first paragraph ,page2, instead of relying on the same reference..
Research Methods	The number of the study sample was not mentioned.

Research Findings	-
Discussion	Link the results of the study with the results of previous studies
Conclusion and Suggestions	-
References and Citation	-
Language	Correcting a spelling error (Universates,Brightspace)
Other issues	-



# International Journal of Instruction Article Evaluation Form

Mr. /Mrs.

It is to acknowledge you that the Executive Committee of *International Journal of Instruction* has decided that the article mentioned below would be reviewed by you. Thank you very much for your contributions.

**Asim ARI**  
**Editor in Chief**

**Name of the article:** Implementation of Learning Innovations to Improve Teacher Competence in Professional Certificate Programs for In-Service Teachers

After reviewing the attached article, please read each item carefully and select the response that best reflects your opinion. To register your response, please **mark** or **type in** the appropriate block.

	Yes	Partially	No
Do you think the title is appropriate?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Does the abstract summarize the article clearly and effectively?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the objectives set clearly?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the issue stated clearly?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the literature review adequate?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the design of the research appropriate, and the exemplary, if any, suitable?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the methodology consistent with the practice?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the findings expressed clearly?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the presentation of the findings adequate and consistent?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the tables, if any, arranged well?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the conclusions and generalizations based on the findings?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the suggestions meaningful, valid, and based on the findings?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are the references adequate?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the language clear and understandable?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is cohesion achieved throughout the article?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Is the work contributing to the field?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

- Evaluation:**
- The article can be published as it is.
  - The article can be published after some revision.
  - The article must undergo a major revision before it can be resubmitted to the journal.
  - The article cannot be published.

Would you like to see the revised article if you have suggested any revisions?  Yes  No

**Please write your report either on this paper or on a spare paper.**

## REPORT

Section of the Manuscript	Comments and Notes
Title- Abstract- Summary	OK
Introduction and Literature Review	The theoretical framework is fine, but is need more information about the Teacher Certification Program because is the core of the manuscript
Research Methods	More description about the sample is need (gender, age, ad others). The authors said "Evaluation of learning outcomes is carried out using standard tests that are nationally provided and is conducted via CBT", but not provide details about this tools.

Research Findings	OK
Discussion	The theoretical and practical implications are needed, and limitatiins as well.
Conclusion and Suggestions	OK
References and Citation	OK
Language	OK
Other issues	OK