Governance Based on Cost Analysis: Unit Cost Analysis for Vocational Schools

Chandra Situmeang¹, Muhammad Ridha Habibi²

ABSTRACT

This research is encouraged by the desire to provide adequate theoretical studies in establishing the policy on providing financial support for students to be able to follow education at various levels of education (in Indonesian terms known as Bantuan Operational Sekolah, abbreviated as BOS) in vocational schools (in Indonesian terms known as Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan abbreviated as SMK). The policy of providing BOS funds that have been implemented is to provide the same amount of funding for each student throughout Indonesia. According to the researchers, the policy is not given, and according to the researchers there are various characteristics that should affect the amount of BOS funds received by each student such as economic capacity, cost standards for each region, and type of department. Based on the mentioned conducted research in two stages. The first stage has been completed by concluding that the variables of school tuition, school facilities, economic capacity of the community, and learning outcomes are interconnected with each other. These results conclude that the policy of providing BOS funds will be more effective when considering the variables of related variables so that the amount given for each student is not the same. Therefore, it concludes that unit cost calculations are required to conduct the learning process for each student as a basis for establishing education funding policies.

Keywords: BOS, cost of education, unit cost, vocational school.

1. Introduction

Education is a very decisive factor in the progress of a nation. Indonesia also believes in the importance of education by ensuring the implementation of good education development. Various levels of regulations provide rules on the implementation of the educational process, for example, the allocation rule of 20% of the total state budget to the education sector is regulated in the Indonesian Constitution. Other rules on compulsory education for children aged 7-15 years are regulated in Law Number 20 Year 2003 regarding National Education System. The rules are derived in a variety of rules aimed at ensuring the implementation of a quality education system.

In the execution of a quality educational process, adequate funding support is required. The funding support includes ensuring that quality education processes are accessible to the community. In the Indonesian context, the government is not only in charge of providing good facilities but must ensure that the public in school age is able to follow the education process. The government needs to be involved in that because there are still a large number of people in the population who have not been able to finance their education independently. In an effort to ensure the ability of the community, the Indonesian government has provided assistance at various levels of education. The operational support is channeled to education ranging from early childhood education to undergraduate level with various names: Bantuan Operasional Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini (BO PAUD) for pre-school level, Bantuan Operasional Sekolah (BOS) for primary to secondary level education and Bantuan Operasional Perguruan Tinggi Negeri (BOSPTN) for higher education. BO PAUD and BOS are distributed based on the number of students enrolled in each school both public and private schools while BOSPTN is distributed using a variety of indicators.

The amount of funds provided to provide this assistance is enormous. This factor encourages researchers to analyze whether the provision of financial assistance has been done optimally. If the grant is not done optimally it will result in a very large budget waste. The government of the channeling of financial support should be the result of a deep cost analysis in order to achieve the goal of channeling the funds. This research is quite unique because the concept of providing direct funding to students is not uncommon in other countries. Other studies conducted in this area are also quite limited because of the practice that is not commonly found.

The basic concept of the distribution of BOS funds is to cover the shortage of total education expense that cannot be borne by the payment of tuition received from students. That is, with the BOS funds the school is expected to be able to run the high quality of education. However, when we look at the facts on the ground, although with the help of BOS funds many schools especially vocational schools are not able to provide high quality education (Gunarti et al., 2017). Vocational schools naturally do cost more than general schools, even for certain majors of enormous operational costs. For example, we can see many vocational high school (known by the term Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan abbreviated as SMK) does not have appropriate and adequate laboratory support.

In the preliminary analysis that has been done, there are at least various causes of the low quality of learning process. The main causes of the background are the local government policy, the ability of the community to contribute to education, poor managerial quality, and also inadequate teaching staff capability. Besides, this is believed to be because of the insufficient government policy that provides BOS per student at the same amount for the whole of Indonesia. In reality, this is certainly not appropriate because the cost of education is greatly influenced by several things, such as the following two main points; the geographical area of a school that will affect the price index and the type of field of science (majors). On the other hand the ability of the community to contribute to education or known by the tuition fee is relatively varied, whereas in urban areas the community is relatively more capable while for rural areas the community is relatively inadequate.

Conceptually, BOS funds coupled with tuition fee will be able to meet the total financing to run the quality learning process. This means that the school is asked to calculate how much donation is expected from the community to be able to fulfill it. If calculated properly, especially for vocational education, community contributions will likely exceed the current level of community contributions to ensure quality vocational education. Schools do not dare to raise the tuition because on the other hand are competing to obtain a large number of students. For example, in many cities in North Sumatera tuition fee in vocational school still have only IDR 100,000 per month with an average of between IDR 150,000 to IDR 250,000. The amount of such educational donations, though added to the BOS funds will not be able to run quality vocational education, especially for some groups that require support by many learning equipment. The consequence of this is that the school must sacrifice the quality of learning.

The above condition is actually a school response to the characteristics of people who have limited economic capacity and not oriented to quality. The combination of these two facts results in poor quality of learning especially in areas where the community has weak economic capacities. In the first stages, this study will collect data to provide empirical evidence that the low cost can collect from the community will have an impact on the low learning outcomes. This is necessary because the
researcher believes that the government should provide a variety of BOS fund support including responding to differences in economic capacity of the community.

The government program is to provide quality education by providing operational assistance to respond to the demand capacity of the community. Based on this concept, it should first obtain a total amount of costs necessary to provide quality education. The amount of these costs is then borne by the community in the form of educational contributions and by the government in the form of BOS funds. If the total cost of education is known then it can be used as a rationale support for policymakers. The researcher believes that once the cost is found, the government can look for a formula to determine where the cost will be obtained. In this view, researchers believe there are at least three main funding sources namely: tuition fee from society, BOS funds from the central government and special fund support from the local government.

Calculation of operational costs is not an easy thing. The complexity of the calculation is influenced by the level of education, type of education, region, and field of science. The Government has acknowledged the differences in operational costs based on education type and type of schools to differentiate BOS for each level of education and differentiate BOS funds for vocational and general schools. The calculation of BOS funds for vocational schools is even more complicated because the learning process is quite complex and produces graduates with more types of financing and variations of major. Another complexity is the difference in the amount of operational costs caused by differences in interregional price standards. Differences in the amount of operational costs between regions have not been taken into account by the government. The amount of BOS funds per student for the same level is still the same for all regions of Indonesia, whereas ideally the government should consider the total cost and be adapted to the ability of people in the region to contribute education.

This cost calculation study can adopt from the calculation pattern applied in the company in calculating the cost of goods to produce a good or service or calculate the cost of a certain activity. In accounting, the theoretical foundation used to solve the problem of cost calculation in schools is similar to that of a public company with a traditional cost accounting approach and Activity Based Costing (ABC). Horngren and Datar say that ABC is a cost approach that focuses on activity as a fundamental cost object. Such activities as a basis for charging costs on other cost objects such as production, services, or customers.

In the above explanation, the activities of the learning process can be calculated as the basis of cost calculation to accumulate the amount of cost of providing educational services. Goods and services produced by the company can be analogous to school graduates and should be calculated the amount of costs to produce a graduate of an education level. This is useful enough to be examined in order to provide a rational academic foundation for policymakers to design an appropriate targeting strategy and provide optimal benefits. Due to various limitations, this study will provide a unit cost analysis for one graduate with focus on analyzing the data obtained for the North Sumatra region. Analysis of the data can already indicate the importance of cost-based analysis of areas and other characteristic of the value of BOS based on various characteristics.

This research was conducted in two stages. In the first stage will be tested whether the variables such as tuition, learning facilities, community economic condition, and learning outcomes are interrelated. While in the second stage will be arranged a financing structure to determine the unit cost to produce a graduate of SMK. The results reported in this study are the first stage results where among these variables have a strong enough relationship so it can be concluded that the funding policy determines the learning outcomes. In the next section will explain the theoretical concepts of Activity Based Costing (ABC) which became the basic theory of unit cost calculation, the results obtained in the research phase one, and analysis and conclusions can be obtained based on these results.

### 1.1 Purpose and urgency of research

In accordance with the above explanation, it is necessary to prepare the financing structure and the amount of financing required for the implementation of quality education. The financing structure will decompose the financing components that must be met in accordance with the National Standards of Education and local content for each region. The amount of financing involves the amount of unit cost for each part of the structure so that it can obtain the total cost of education and also the amount of cost per student. The final goal to be achieved by this research is to encourage the government to adopt an optimal funding policy.

The specific purpose of this study is to obtain the cost of providing education in vocational schools by meeting national education standards coupled with local context. Once these objectives can be achieved, the results can be used for various purposes such as inputs to the government that the allocation of equitable BOS funds across Indonesia needs to be reviewed. Government needs to pay attention to several variables in the establishment of BOS funds per region such as unit cost to produce one vocational school graduate for each region and community capacity in the area. The government can then assign BOS funds that suit the nature of the matter. This study will be focused to arrange financing structure to be able to carry out the learning process according with national standard of education. In another view it can be said that this research will try to determine the amount of cost needed to produce one graduate. This study is devoted to calculate the structure and the amount of costs in Vocational High School in North Sumatra. As an effort to determine the amount of cost to produce something so this is actually an attempt to calculate the cost of production. In the study of accounting, the calculation of cost of production became a study discussed in an accounting specialization that is cost accounting and management. In a public company the cost of production refers to the amount of costs required to produce a unit of goods. Determination of the production price of one unit of goods will be a reference to the determination of the selling price. The concept can also be applied in educational institutions where graduates of a school can be viewed as a product of the process being carried out. In order to produce the product is certainly required cost in accordance with the standard process set.

### 2. Literature review

#### 2.1 Activity based costing (ABC)

In calculating the cost of production there are several methods but the most common is the traditional method and Activity Based Costing (ABC) method. The traditional method imposes the cost of producing individual units using direct working hours. In traditional costing systems, the cost drivers used are based only on the unit, as measured in direct working hours, or material costs. Unit-based activity triggers are factors that cause cost changes when the number of units generated changes.

A more recent and comprehensive approach is the Activity Based Costing (ABC) method. The ABC method is based on the assumption that a product absorbs a variety of overhead resources or has many cost drivers. The cost structure of each product is also not the same where one product can absorb more costs than other products. CIMA (Chartered Institute of Management Accountants) defines ABC as an approach to costing and observing activities that involves tracking activities that use resources in a series of processes to produce final output. Activity is a collection of actions performed within an organization that are useful for purposes of activity-based costing.

The traditional method of financing in 1980 has been widely challenged due to its less relevant method, less accurate, and less timeliness. At that time, introduced a new method is the method of financing Activity Based Costing (ABC). Krishnan (2007) stated that Activity Based Costing (hereafter abbreviated ABC) was first developed by Cooper and Kaplan, a board system designed to reduce the risk of inconsistent and volatile cost allocations that is very close to traditional boarding systems and is expected to provide accurate in better cost allocation. Various researchers globally have conducted testing on Activity Based Costing, Rogers & Bangert Jr (1994), Capps & Timlin (1998), Ip, Liu & Yau (2002), Kramwiede (1990), Krupnick & Tyson (1997), and Sarolokela, Ebrati, K Shaunhalah, & Ebrati (2012) stated that ABC besides gives better accuracy in determining the financing of a product, can also improve the basis of strategic policy, resource allocation used, product mix, price and marketing. Furthermore, basically a costing method based on ABC is then highly beneficial for the complex manufacturing industry, individual with distinct product costs, and different industrial environments. ABC then provides new findings in allocating overhead costs on which ABC can facilitate the identification of how individual customers affect the cost of supply.

Ruhupatty and Maguad (2014), stated that ABC can solve the problem of inaccurate accumulation of the cost of doing traditionally by separating it based on each type of activity on each
cost object. The ABC method focuses on the allocation of overhead costs to each activity-based cost group by using controlling resources and then allocates the costs that are in the activity-based cost group to the product using the activity cost controller. The following figure below will give you a clear picture of the costing flow based on the explanations given earlier. ABC is a more accurate costing method than the traditional way, so it will impact on the better state of using it for managerial decision making such as pricing strategies in business contexts that produce variable products and also determine the cost of production in a complicated mechanism of activity. Cooper and Kaplan in Coskun and Yilmaz (2015) stated that ABC is actually designed originally to be used in business enterprises and manufacturing industries that produce finished products, but then, ABC is widely accepted in the context of service businesses which then provide excellent benefits.

2.2 Implementation of activity based costing on service sector

ABC is a very useful decision-making framework within the context of economic analysis in the service sector, particularly in the planning, controlling, and decision-making sections. Cooper and Kaplan In Krishnan (2007) argue that service firms can benefit from the use of ABC in their business operations as well as manufacturing companies have felt, as in the context of analyzing operational expenses and carrying out service activities that require different types and forms of resources.

In addition, ABC can be an effective tool in service companies in terms of tracking the costs incurred on services that have been generated and tools that are very helpful in implementing total quality thinking in service companies used by management in analyzing and delivering their value to customers. An example that can be stated is how ABC systems in hospitals can help managers better perform operational efficiency assessments, establish more comprehensive comparisons to analyze hospital performance with other hospitals, and optimize the range of services provided to patients in the hospital.

Many studies have proven that ABC can provide information that enhances a manager's ability to identify cost-saving opportunities and leverage them to increase the preparation of better budgetary calculations. Thus, the ABC-based costing system will be able to help the service sector to understand the cost and value of the essential services activities in controlling the increase in operational costs.

Mahtab, Amir, Ahmad, and Auzair (2011) states that today many service organizations are revamping their financing system and using ABC as a new system that is more competitive in the market today. A lot of research on the service sector is limited to the development of costing methods without any empirical conclusions about the cost calculations. ABC is the most widely recognized method or costing system that best fits in allocating overhead costs. If in the past the use of ABC in manufacturing companies has been widely used, but now its use in the service sector is increasingly needed especially in the education subsector although it is believed that the use of ABC in the service sector especially educational organizations is still not comprehensive.

Ruhupatty and Maguad (2016) stated that there has been a lot of research that studies the benefits of ABC applications in the service sector. Vazikaris, Karagiannis, & Tsipis (2010) examines the application of ABC in the public sector, especially to measure the cost of services performed by public offices; Krishnan (2007) argues that educational institutions face the challenge of staying competitive and feeling the benefits of improving quality, improving efficiency and eliminating activities that create non-value-added costs to the organization. Managers of educational organizations need financing information to be able to determine managerial decisions that will enable them to improve quality efficiency, and eliminate activities that generate non-value-added costs.

This study shows that the application of the ABC system will be able to help educational organizations to improve operational performance and improve the quality of services provided to the needs of their customers.

Coskun and Yilmaz (2015) argue that the allocation of costs to the service sector is often more complicated than that of manufacturing or trading companies. The fact that the resulting form is not a product that is physically visible, the service company will be more careful in determining the cost object and allocating costs to the right conditions and ways. ABC has become a new way and approach of cost allocation methods that divide indirect costs on service companies based on their respective activities.

2.3 Activity based costing at education institution

Research conducted by Krishnan (2007) is one of the research conducted on the educational organization that is the institution of higher education. The study aims to analyze applications of ABC at higher education institutions, especially at universities and how it contributes to operations and business in the context of decision-making. Another thing to be aware of is to be able to verify that the ABC financing system can provide better control than the traditional way. Krishnan's research has resulted in the formula of departmentalization of several services provided to college students based on their respective groups. In addition, a cost allocation model based on ABC and ABC model has been generated for the services provided to the students on administrative and registration offices affairs. The results of the study suggest that ABC provides a more accurate system in cost management and enables high-level managers to calculate the total cost of the products services provided to students. In short, the ABC method is more accurate than using traditional approaches. The ABC method provides a more accurate system in cost management and enables high-level managers to calculate the total cost of the products services provided to students. In short, the ABC method is more accurate than using traditional approaches.

Coskun and Yilmaz (2013) conducted pricing research on educational institutions using the ABC approach. Of course, one of the pricing will depend on the cost that will be generated in running a service cycle other than the market base. They stated that by using ABC the costs that would be sacrificed per student in providing services provided to educational institutions would be calculated more accurately than using traditional costing. The ABC method provides a more accurate system in cost management and enables high-level managers to calculate the total cost of the products services provided to students. In short, the ABC method is more accurate than using traditional approaches. The ABC method provides a more accurate system in cost management and enables high-level managers to calculate the total cost of the products services provided to students. In short, the ABC method is more accurate than using traditional approaches.
1. Survey of vocational schools in North Sumatera region which is a sample of research studies to obtain an overview of the learning process, the condition of educational facilities and the contribution of community in the form of tuition fee paid to schools.

2. Analysis of linkages between variables such as learning outcomes, learning processes, educational facility conditions, tuition paid by the community, and economic capacity of the community.

3. Drafting educational activities ideal according to national standards of education as reference materials for phase 2.

Phase Two (January to May 2018)

This second phase is the most complicated stage because it requires a deep and detailed understanding. The second phase cost allocation has the following sub-stages:

1. Identify and Define Activity

The most important step in the implementation of the Activity Based Costing (ABC) system is to identify the activities on which the system is based. If applied in the vocational school, it must be determined the activities that must be done to produce SMK graduates. This will be divided into parts i.e. ideal activities (should be run according to educational standards) and activities that are actually implemented. This stage is quite difficult and requires quite a long time. The general procedure for doing so is to interview all the people involved or at least to the party responsible for the activity. Theoretically, how to understand the activity and how the activity is accumulated is organized into five levels: unit-level, batch-level, product-level, customer-level and organization-sustaining. This level distinguishes the cost characteristics based on their characteristics.

2. Charge the Cost to Activity Fees Pool

Pool activity cost is a container that accumulates all costs associated with a single activity within the ABC system. For example, the cost pool for the implementation of the automotive practicum will be burdened with all the resources consumed to carry out the automotive lab work such as the cost of the electric workshop, the cost of practicum maintenance, etc. The activity size in this cost pool is the number of orders received. This activity is a batch-level activity because every activity leads to work regardless of the number of students. Most overhead costs are classified in the accounting system based on the cost is incurred.

3. Calculating Activity Rates

The activity tariff will be used for the overhead cost to each student. The team will determine the total activity that should really happen (ideal version according to educational standards) and the real thing happened.

4. Charge the cost to the cost object by using activity rate and activity size. In the second phase allocation, activity tariffs are used to charge each student’s expenses. This is done by diverting overhead rates per cost group by the amount of cost drivers charged to each student.

5. After the production cost is calculated it will be compiled final calculation to determine the amount of cost to produce a graduate of vocational school.

4. Result and discussion

4.1 Result

In the first stage survey and analysis of preliminary data have been conducted to provide an initial description of the issues to be studied. The results are summarized in table 1. After performing tabulation of survey data then conducted correlation analysis to know the relationship between various variables above. This is done to obtain an overview of the research issues to be analyzed further. The results of the data correlation calculations are presented in Table 2.

4.2 Discussion

Based on the results of correlation analysis that has been done and displayed in Table 2 can be found various interesting analysis. If we look at the relationship between the economic capacity of the community and the learning outcomes of the vocational school student’s in the school, the relationship is quite weak at 0.12. This means there is no strong direct link between the two. This result is quite interesting because the initial guess of the researchers there is a strong relationship between economic

ability with student achievement. This fact at the same time makes it necessary to do a more in-depth analysis of some of the things that may affect the relationship of both things.
A stronger relationship is shown between the amount of tuition paid by the community and the national examination score of 0.30 at the moderate level. This relationship cannot be analyzed individually. School fees paid by the community are used by schools to provide the necessary equipment in the learning process. The high school fees paid by the community ensures that the community has the ability to provide learning facilities such as laboratories, internet, and so forth. Based on the results of correlation analysis conducted it is evident that there is a strong relationship between the amount of school fees paid with the quality of educational facilities owned by the school that is equal to 0.28. This relationship can be said to be very strong thus providing clear evidence that vocational schools do require substantial costs to support the implementation of quality education processes.

Furthermore, the results of the analysis also show a moderate relationship between the quality of educational facilities and learning outcomes of 0.28. Theoretically, this relationship should be strong enough but it should be suspected that many factors affect the value of the national exam in addition to the students' ability. It has become a common concern that the results of national examinations are not entirely valid as a measure of student learning outcomes. Nevertheless, the value of the national exam is still quite feasible to be used to analyze the problems studied. This moderate relationship shows that the quality of educational means has a relationship with the learning outcomes so that schools need to give good care to provide adequate means.

The strongest relationship between the relationships analyzed was between the incomes of the community and the fees paid. This is clear evidence that schools are applying for school fees according to the community's capacity around the school not on the basis of the ideal standard of education to be met. This strong relationship indicates that the government needs to intervene specifically in areas with a fairly weak economy. Allowing schools to adapt to the economic capacity of the community is very dangerous because it certainly will sacrifice the quality of learning.

The above results also show strong empirical evidence that the policy to provide equitable boss funds across the entire territory of Indonesia is urgently needed to be evaluated. The government should consider various special characteristics: factors to be able to channel the boss funds more optimally. This result also concludes that research on unit cost is required to produce a graduate of vocational school. The results to be obtained will be used as an academic appraisal to evaluate the BOS funding policy. This research will be continued at the second stage to calculate the cost based on region, characteristic and department in vocational school. These results are integrated with the economic capacity data of the community can be a good rational basis to specify the boss funds discharged by the government.

5. Conclusions and policy implementation

5.1 Conclusions

Based on data analysis and discussion that has been submitted in the previous section, then the following conclusions are generated:

1. The economic ability of the community has a weak correlation with learning outcomes as measured by the national exam results. This relationship has a contradiction with other relationships so that it will be evaluated further in the second phase of the study.

2. The amount of tuition fees paid has a moderate correlation relationship with the learning outcomes as measured by the national test scores. This indicates that the funds obtained by schools to run the learning process will affect the learning process. The relationship between the tuition fees is likely to not directly affect the learning outcomes but the tuition received by the school is used to provide adequate educational facilities. This is supported by the analysis of the relationship between the quality of educational facilities and learning outcomes.

3. The quality of learning support facilities has a strong relationship with student learning outcomes. These results provide recommendations that improved learning facilities are needed to improve learning outcomes.

4. The economic ability of the community is strongly correlated with the tuition fees so that regions with better levels of economy will be more flexible to implement high school fees. This provides a very strong indication that schools make adjustments to the size of school fees with the economic capacity of the community. This is not very good because it is likely that schools will sacrifice quality to be able to reduce the amount of tuition.

5. The amount of fees paid has a strong relationship with the quality of educational facilities owned by the school. This is quite rational because school fees received by schools are a source of pensions for the purchase of educational facilities.

5.2 Policy Implementation

Based on the results of research that has been submitted above, here are the various policy implications suggested:

1. The government needs to pay attention to the community's ability to implement BOS funding policy so that the amount of aid given is not the same between one region and the other. This is due to differences in tuition fees between regions which is a picture of the economic capacity of the communities directly or indirectly affect the learning outcomes.

2. The government’s size on human development index and regional government’s size on human development index in each region needs to be evaluated further in the second phase of the study. In other words, making adjustments between regions which is a picture of the economic capacity of the communities directly or indirectly affect the learning outcomes.

3. The government through the education office needs to calculate the unit cost required to provide one student’s education. The unit cost can be used as a governance instrument to create strategic policies. This research will develop a cost calculation guide that will be implemented in the next stage of research.

References


Krumwiede KR. 1998. ABC why it's tried and how it succeeds. Strategic Finance. 73(10). 32.