CHAPTER IV  
DATA ANALYSIS, FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

A. Data Analysis

This study was a qualitative research which described the findings of analyzed data and used descriptive method in which the data are collected, analyzed and drawn a conclusion. In this case, the study analyzed the grammatical errors made by students to find out the types of grammatical errors which got errors and the causes of errors occurrences.

The 20 recount texts as the sources of the study were written by the tenth grade students at SMA Budisatrya Medan, in which they were given the same topic about their interesting experience. The data were identified and classified into 5 types: verb, pronoun, preposition, punctuation and spelling. Besides, the data which got errors were analyzed to find out the causes of errors.

English grammar books, materials related to grammar, theories about types and causes of errors, and former studies related to grammatical errors were used to analyze the data.

1. Types of Errors

After analyzing the data taken from the 20 writings recount texts collected, then the percentage of errors in grammar is shown in the following table. The classification of grammatical errors consists of errors of verb, errors of pronoun, errors of preposition, errors of punctuation, and errors of spelling.
Table 4.1. The Percentage of Data Analysis of the Grammatical Errors in Recount Texts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Grammatical Errors</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>57.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Pronoun</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Preposition</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Punctuation</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>20.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td>155</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: the statistic taken from Appendix C

From the table, it can be seen that errors of verb got the highest cases, which means that this kind of grammatical errors dominantly occurred. Based on the classifications of errors, it was found that 155 errors occurred (see table 4.1). The explanations about them could be seen below.

a. Verb

Verb was the type of error which got the highest total percentage of grammatical errors occurred. There were 89 errors found. Based on the analysis, there were some cases the students made errors in producing verb form.

1) Students made errors in producing verb past form. They still used verb present in the sentences whereas they wrote about their past experience. So, they failed to recognize changed verb present into verb past in regular and irregular verbs. The examples could be seen below.

- We start on 06.00 a.m from Budisatrya. (It should be: “We started on 06.00 a.m from Budisatrya.”) (RH:X-2)

- Last week, I go to Lumbini with my friend. (It should be: “Last week, I went to Lumbini with my friend”.) (AA:X-3)
The words ‘start’ and ‘go’ should be changed into regular (-d/-ed) or irregular verb past to indicate the past tense of ‘start’ and ‘go’ because the students wrote the text based on their past experience so it must be changed into past tense.

2) Students made errors in producing verb especially in auxiliary verb form. Sometimes, students also omitted the auxiliary verb when they shared their past experience. The examples could be seen below.

- I and my family so happy. (It should be: “I and my family were so happy”.)(NAL: X-4)
- It very cold air. (It should be: “It was very cold air”.)(NAL: X-4)

The student omitted auxiliary verb that must appeared in those sentences. If the sentence indicated to adjective so it must be followed by auxiliary verb. That’s why the student made errors because she does not complete in writing her sentence.

3) Students also added auxiliary verb which did not need it in the sentences actually. So, the sentence became wrong. The examples illustrated below.

- I amate very much. (It should be: “I ate very much”).(PMS: X-1)
- I am become amazing. (It should be: “I became amazing”).(IL: X-3)

The word ‘am’ should be erased in those sentences. The errors occurred because of the presence of the word that must not be appeared in sentences. The auxiliary verb is used to indicate passive voice, adjective, and progressive tense. So, that’s why error occurred in those sentences.
4) Students actually knew that they had to use verb 2 in their writing. But, they failed in changing the verb. They did not apply what they have learned actually. The example could be seen below.

- *I plaied* with my sister. (It should be: “I played with my sister”.)
  (ZA: X-3)

- *I and young sistersleept*. (It should be: “I and young sister slept”.) (ZA: X-3)

The words ‘*plaied*’ and ‘*sleept*’ should be changed into regular or irregular verb past. In this case, the students tried to change the verb into verb past, but they failed in changing it. If his aim was to change the word into verb past ‘play’, then he had to write ‘played’ not ‘plaied’ because it was regular verb. And the word ‘sleep’ must be changed ‘slept’ not ‘sleept’ because it was irregular verb.

b. Pronoun

The errors of pronoun got 6 cases with percentage 3.9%. The errors of pronoun happened because some students made errors in placing pronoun in their sentence. They did not know that every pronoun had their own function. So, the students still confuse to choose and to use the word to be the right pronoun. The examples could be seen below:

1. *Once time me and family on the way went touncle’s house.* (It should be: “Once time *I and family on the way went touncle’s house.*”)(PEH: X-3)

2. *me and family had to worry...* (It should be: “I and family had to worry...”)(PEH: X-3)
3. *One day, when it was twelve years old...* (It should be: “*One day, when I was twelve years old...*”) (ARF: X-4)

The students simply wrote pronoun without knowing its function. The students could not write the words ‘me’ and ‘it’ because it did not match with the sentences. The function of pronoun ‘me’ to indicate first person pronoun, but as the object. While in that sentence, the student tried to write pronoun as the subject. Because after pronoun there was verb, so it must be changed pronoun ‘I’. The word ‘it’ represented the thing except people. The student wanted to share his experience, so exactly the ‘it’ not true in that sentence. So, it must be ‘I’ because he shared his experience not other thing.

c. **Preposition**

Errors of preposition got 10 cases or 6.5 %. In using a preposition, one should be aware because there was no certain rule for this. One has to determine which preposition should be used based on its context. In this case, the errors occurred because of the students did not know how to use preposition based on context. They only realized that each of prepositions can be accepted in every sentence. So that students did errors repeatedly. The examples could be shown below.

1. *We went at Sunday.* (It should be: “*We went on Sunday.*”) (RH: X-2)

2. *We started on 06.00 a.m from Budisatrya.* (It should be: “*We started at 06.00 a.m from Budisatrya*”) (RH: X-2)
Sentences in number 1 and 2 had the same form of error. It appeared because the student had no knowledge how to use preposition based on its function. The preposition ‘at’ in the first sentence was wrong. The preposition ‘at’ to designate specific times (at 12.15 p.m.). So, to designate days or dates the student had to use preposition ‘on’. And the preposition ‘on’ in the second sentence also was wrong. In that sentence, she wrote preposition ‘on’ to designate specific times. While to designate specific times the student must be used preposition ‘at’. That is why her sentences became error because she did not place preposition based on its function.

d. Errors of Punctuation

Errors of punctuation got 32 cases with percentage 20.6%. Students made errors of punctuation in using capitalization. They did not aware how to use capitalization in their sentence which actually it was so important. Students often made errors in using capitalization such as the beginning of sentence and name of place. The example can be seen below.

- We started at 06.00 a.m from budisatrya. (It should be: “We started at 06.00 a.m. from Budisatrya”.) (RH: X-2)

Sometimes, the student made errors of punctuation in producing commas and apostrophe. Sometimes they added apostrophe that actually did not need and sometimes omitted it. The example can be known below.

- The village in West Sumatra’s. (It should be: The village in West Sumatra”.) (FH: X-2)
Sentences number 1 and 2 had the same form of error. It happened because of the students got carelessness in writing those sentences. They did not aware about the use of punctuation. In the first sentence, student did not put upper case letter to indicate specific place. To indicate proper names of people, ethnic groups, places, countries, institution and religions, it must be used capitalization. In the second sentence, the student put apostrophe that actually did not need in that sentence. The word ‘West Sumatra’ was a part of Sumatra not to show the possession of Sumatra. That is why their sentences got error. Because to write well, students must be punctuate well, but to punctuate well, the students must also wrote well.

e. Spelling

Errors of spelling got 18 cases with percentage 11.6 %. The errors in spelling occurred because of the carelessness and less in practicing when the students wrote because most of the students did not know aware about the spelling of the words. So, they were often wrote a word without incorrect spelling. Students added a letter in a word which actually it became incorrect spelling. The examples can be seen below.

- ...but we were not borred visited Brastagi. (It should be: "... but we were not bored visited Brastagi").(STF: X-4)
- Durring in journey... (It should be: “During in journey...”).(AK: X-4)
- Finished the rest, we enjoyed a verry happy holiday. (It should be: “Finished the rest, we enjoyed a very happy holiday").(MYN: X-1)
Sentences no 1, 2 and 3 had the same form of error. It appeared because the students did not know how to write the words in English language. For example, the word ‘borred’. The student did not think that how to write the word ‘borred’ with single ‘r’ or double ‘r’. It happened also in the second and third sentence. Sometimes the students thought that spelling the words in English was same what they said with what they had to write. That is why the students wrote the words without knowing it was correct or wrong.

2. Causes of Errors

After analyzing the data, to find out the causes of students’ grammatical errors, the writer did interview to the students. According to Erdogan(2005: 265) the causes of errors are categorized within two domains, they are interlingual and intralingual transfer. Based on the interview, the result could be seen below.

![Diagram of the Causes of Grammatical Errors](image)

Figure 4.1. Diagram of the Causes of Grammatical Errors
From the diagram above, it could be seen that intralingual transfer most contributed the causes of errors with percentage 90% or 140 cases. Then, it was followed by interlingual transfer with percentage 10% or 15 cases. Almost the errors were influenced by intralingual transfer because the students had limited knowledge about English rules and structures and their inabilities to apply what they have learned. Besides, some errors were influenced by interlingual transfer because the students still were influenced by Indonesian language. The explanation could be seen below.

**a. Interlingual Transfer**

In this research, interlingual transfer contributed the errors with percentage only 10% or 15 cases. It occurred at different levels such as transfer of phonological, morphological, grammatical and lexical semantics elements of the native language into the target language. The students made errors because they were still influenced by their first language. Some of the students made errors in changing the verb. In English verb in past should be added by suffix-ed or-d and should be added by suffix-s or -es in present tense. Meanwhile, in Indonesia the verb did not change even in present or past tense. It made students confused and did errors repeatedly. Then, there was a student made errors in noun pluralization. It occurred due to the difference level of morphological. Because in Indonesia, to show noun pluralization it did not need adding suffix –s or –es. Besides, in English we should be added it. The examples could be shown below.

1) “There is many animals”, instead of “There were many animals”.

(AAR: X-2)
2) “In SeaWorld, I saw many fish”, instead of “In SeaWorld, I saw many fishes”. (AAR: X-2)

In the first example, student thought that present form of to be ‘is’ and past form was the same. The student assumed that the meaning was the same, so why it has to be changed. Then in the second example, the word ‘fish’ should be added by the suffix –es. Before the word ‘fish’ there was, also ‘many’ which indicated the word fish should be in the plural form. The student said that she did not know how to show that the noun in plural or singular in English language, because the student thought that in Indonesian language there was no rule how to write that the noun singular or plural. That is why the students’ error influenced by the first language (Indonesian language).

b. Intralingual Transfer

In this research, intralingual transfer the most contributed the errors with percentage 90 % or 140 cases. It is caused by the influence of one target language item upon another. Students frequently made errors because they had lacked of knowledge about English rules and structures. For example, learners attempt to use two markers at the same time in one sentence since they have not mastered the language yet.

According to Richards (1971:19-22) intralingual transfer divided into 4 categories; overgeneralization, ignorance of rule restriction, incomplete application of rules and false concepts hypothesized. Based on the interview, the result could be seen below.
Figure 4.2. Diagram of the Causes of Grammatical Errors

Intralingual transfer divided into 4 categories; (overgeneralization 65 cases or 46%), (incomplete rule application 14 cases or 10%), (false concept hypothesize 61 cases or 44%) and (ignorance of rule restriction 0%). The explanations could be seen below.

1) **Overgeneralization**

In this research, overgeneralization had percentage 46%. The students created a deviant structure on the basis of the other structure in the target language. They lacked knowledge about the elements of grammar and over generalized only what they have knew. The errors could be seen in using preposition and punctuation. The student only knew about preposition and also punctuation, so they over generalized the preposition without knowing its function.
a) “We started on 06.00 a.m from Budisatrya”, instead of “We started at 06.00 a.m from Budisatrya”. (RH: X-2)

b) “This was not the first time we were to Brastagi”, instead of “This was not the first time we were in Brastagi”. (STF: X-4)

c) “After some hours I and my family arrived in home”, instead of “After some hours I and my family arrived at home”. (NS: X-1)

Sentences in number 1, 2 and 3 got errors because of overgeneralization. All the students in the sentence above said that they only knew the preposition without knowing its function. The students over generalized the entire preposition that they only knew. Students did not know about the rule or they could not apply what they have learned,

2) Ignorance of Rule Restriction

In this research, ignorance of rule restriction had percentage 0 %. There were no students which made a deviant structure in which grammatical rules are applied into inappropriate contexts in which other rules should be used instead.

3) Incomplete Rule Application

In this research, incomplete rule application contributed the errors with percentage 10 %. Some of students got failure to fully develop a structure. They omitted some elements which were needed in the sentence. Some cases could be seen in omitting to be and preposition. The Examples could be seen below.

a) “We went in the morning 8.30 a.m by car”. Instead of “We went in the morning at 8.30 a.m. by car”. (LL: X-4)
b) “I and my family so happy”. Instead of “I and my family were so happy”. (LL: X-4)

The students omitted *preposition* and *to be* which important in that sentence. He said that he forgot to put the preposition and to be. Meaning that the student got failure to fully develop a structure. The student made errors because of the incomplete application of rules.

4) **False Concept Hypothesize**

In this research, false concept hypothesized contributed the errors with percentage 44%. The learner failed to comprehend fully distinction in the target language. The examples could be seen below.

a) “*I am and my friends went to this place for refreshing*”. Instead of “*I and my friends went to this place for refreshing*”. (YS: X-3)

b) “*I amate very much*”, instead of “*I ate very much*”. (PMS: X-3)

The first sentence, student said that when she wrote a sentence, it should be followed by *to be*. Whether the sentence was passive or active. Then in the second sentence, student said that she only knew *to be* could be used in every sentence without knowing the function. In this case, both of them failed to comprehend fully distinction in the target language.

**B. Findings**

The analysis revealed that the grammatical errors existed in recount text written by tenth grade students as SMA Budisatrya Medan. After analyzing all the texts, the findings of this study could be seen below.
1. The types of grammatical errors found are verb (89 cases or 57.4 %), pronoun (6 cases or 3.9 %), preposition (10 cases or 6.5 %), punctuation (32 cases or 20.6 %) and spelling (18 cases or 11.6 %). The errors of verb occurred in changing the verb into past. The errors of pronoun occurred in placing the pronoun based on its function. The errors of preposition occurred in generalizing all of the prepositions without knowing its function. The errors of spelling occurred in mistyping when write the words. The errors of punctuation occurred because of carelessness.

2. The causes of errors that occurred were interlingual and intralingual transfer. The interlingual transfer influenced the errors with percentage 10 %. Besides, intralingual transfer 90 %. Then, intralingual transfer divided into 4 categories; overgeneralization (46 %), ignorance of rule restriction (0 %), incomplete application of rule (10 %) and false concept hypothesized (44 %). It was caused by intralingual transfer if students have limited knowledge about grammar especially (verb, pronoun, preposition, punctuation and spelling) and the rules how to form it into a sentence or they have inabilities to apply what they have learned. On the other side, it was caused by interlingual transfer if students are influenced by their first native language (Indonesian language).

C. Discussions

From the explanation in the previous data analysis, the errors occur in verb, pronoun, preposition, punctuation and spelling.
In the former studies, however, which analyzed about grammatical errors, the error of verb commonly found that in changing the verb into regular (-d and -ed) and irregular verb which make the errors occur. In a research about the students’ writing conducted by Anggraeni (2013) found that one of the errors which are made by students is tense or verb. Such error has been a common issue for those who concern about analyzing the errors of Indonesian students in English grammar. This case is also found in this study, but, this study finds that besides verb (regular or irregular verb), punctuation and spelling also occur in students’ errors.

Related to the finding of this study and study about the grammatical errors analysis produced by speaking of English department students (A Study Speaking Class of ELT Department of IAIN Walisongo) conducted by Adib (2012) shows that the verb is dominant error that occurs in speaking.

This study, however, has a big possibility in causing the invalid data exist. But, this problem can be avoided because students are given the same topics about their interesting experience, so the students write their experience with different stories and the texts are their original works. However, the amount of students’ writings depend on the students’ activeness and creativity, it means that students who are active in writing have a big possibility to make greater errors.

The errors which are made by the students are caused by interlingual and intralingual transfer. The intralingual transfer divided into 4 categories; overgeneralization, ignorance of rule restriction, incomplete rule application and false concepts hypothesize. The dominant error is the verb were dominantly occurs because of intralingual transfer with percentage 90 %.
Referring to the students’ quality in writing based on the components which should be mastered well according to Raimes (1983) in Syarifah (2015), then it can be concluded that the students produced writing is not good yet. It is seen from the perspective of grammar, especially through the analysis of grammatical errors which is found in this study.